



Ministry of Agriculture  
and Rural Development

United Nations  
Development Programme



*Viet Nam*

---

**Project Support to Public Administration Reform Programme  
in Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development  
VIE 02/016**

# **GENDER ANALYSIS IN MARD QUALITATIVE STUDY**

**Opinions, ideas problems and needs of civil servants under MARD  
regarding gender equality and gender mainstreaming**

**Astrid Tripodi  
Ta Ngoc Sinh**

September 2004

## Table of contents

<b>Introduction.....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>A. Methodology.....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>I. Direct interviews with Civil Servants.....</b>	<b>6</b>
1. Interview Methodology .....	6
2. Profile of the Interviewees.....	6
3. Preparation and Training of the Interviewers .....	7
<b>II. Focus Group Discussions.....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>III. Logistics and Experience with the Interviews.....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>B. Results.....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>I. Personnel organization.....</b>	<b>10</b>
1. Data collection.....	10
2. Recruitment.....	10
3. Job assignments.....	11
4. Promotion and Career .....	11
4.1. Constraints for promotion.....	11
4.2. Career planning.....	13
5. Professional Training.....	14
6. Salaries.....	15
<b>II. Social benefits.....</b>	<b>15</b>
1. Health care .....	15
2. Maternity and child care leave.....	15
3. Retirement.....	16
<b>III. Family and Work.....</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>IV. Working environment.....</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>V. Organizational structure.....</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>VI. Gender Awareness and Training.....</b>	<b>18</b>
1. Awareness raising .....	18
2. Gender training .....	18
2.1 Training Methodology.....	19
2.2. Training material .....	19
2.3. Training content .....	20
2.4. Participants .....	21
2.5. Training organization and logistics .....	22
3.. Mainstreaming into Schools under MARD .....	22
3.1. Teaching curricula.....	22
3.2. Teachers.....	23
<b>VII. Gender policies.....</b>	<b>24</b>
1. Information .....	24
2. Commitment .....	25
3. Design and Implementation of Gender Policies.....	25
4. Monitoring and Evaluation.....	27

<b>VIII. Gender related Groups.....</b>	<b>28</b>
1. The Committee for the Advancement of Women.....	28
1.1. Role of CFAW.....	28
1.2. Authority of CFAW.....	28
1.3. Sub-CFAWs.....	29
1.4. CFAW Members.....	30
2. Trade Union and Women’s Trade Committee .....	31
3. The Gender Taskforce .....	32
<b>IX. Companies.....</b>	<b>32</b>
<b>C. Recommendations .....</b>	<b>33</b>
<b>I. Recommendations for the PAR Project.....</b>	<b>33</b>
<b>II. Recommendations for MARD.....</b>	<b>35</b>
<b>III. Other Recommendations.....</b>	<b>35</b>
<b>Outlook.....</b>	<b>36</b>
<b>Annexes.....</b>	<b>37</b>
Annex 1: Interview Guidelines for the Qualitative Study .....	37
Annex 2: Locations and Profiles of the Interviewees.....	45
Annex 3: Group Discussions (List of Participating Units) .....	52
Annex 4: Persons involved in the study .....	53

## **Abbreviations and Acronyms**

CFAW	Committee For the Advancement of Women
DARD	Department of Agriculture and Rural Development
DOP	Department of Organization and Personnel
MARD	Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development
MoHA	Ministry of Home Affairs
NCFAW	National Committee For the Advancement of Women
PAR	Public Administration Reform
POA	Plan Of Action
ToT	Training of Trainers
WTC	Women's Trade Committee

## **Introduction**

The Gender Strategy to the Year 2010 and the Gender Plan of Action to the Year 2005 for the Agriculture and Rural Development Sector have been approved by the Minister of Agriculture and Rural Development in October 2003.

At the beginning of Phase 2 (2003-2006) of the UNDP Support Project to the Public Administration Reform in the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development gender considerations have been included into the project planning document.

Therefore a Gender Taskforce has been established in February 2004 within the PAR Project in order to promote and support gender integration into project's activities. The members of the Gender Taskforce are representatives from selected units in MARD.

In order to understand the existing needs and future options for gender mainstreaming in the different MARD units and to orientate the gender activities in the PAR project, the following gender analysis has been carried out in form of a qualitative study.

The aim of this study was to collect a large variety of ideas, opinions, problems and needs of civil servants regarding gender issues and gender mainstreaming in order to draw recommendations on the activities regarding gender issues for the PAR Project and MARD.

This three-months-study has been carried out from July to September 2004 by a team consisting in an International Consultant, one National Consultant and four National Interviewers.

## A. Methodology

The study has been carried out in Hanoi, Ha Tay and Ho Chi Minh City in Cuc and Vu departments, institutes, companies, and technical and management schools under MARD. In order to collect the different opinions, direct interviews with civil servants have been carried out and three focus group discussions have been held. The interview locations are listed in annex 2.

### I. Direct Interviews with Civil Servants

#### 1. Interview Methodology

The interviews have been carried out individually face-to-face with 202 civil servants of 60 different units under MARD. Tape recorders were used to register the interviews and exact transcriptions of the tapes have been completed and then analyzed.

The interviews were held in semi-structured way, using as much as possible open questions to collect as many different opinions as possible. Closed questions were used to orientate the interviewee towards a specific subject.

Guidelines for semi-structured interviews had been prepared in advance by the International and National Consultant as support tool for the interviewers. The guidelines have been discussed, pre-tested and modified and suggestions of members of the Gender Taskforce, Trade Union, Women Trade Committee, Youth Union and CFAW integrated. These guidelines were not meant to be used as a questionnaire during the interviews but as a starting aid for the interviewers regarding the semi-structured way of interviewing, the leading questions to ask and the subject areas to focus on.

#### 2. Profile of the Interviewees

The different units under MARD were asked to provide interviewees with different profiles based on the following selection criteria:

**Sex:** The target was to interview female and male candidates on a 1:1 ratio. In fact, the interviews have been carried out on 93 women and 109 men.

**Position:**

- Leadership position (the majority of leaders being men, women were preferred if available)
- Technical/commercial/teaching/research staff incl. head of section/office

- Age:** Two age groups were chosen according to the sex:
- Men: < 45 and ≥ 45 years
  - Women: < 40 and ≥ 40 years
- These age groups have been defined due to suitability for promotion, upgrading training, work experience and ambitions for career.
- Education level:**
- postgraduate level
  - university level
  - technical level

The profile of the interviewees is available in annex 2.

### **3. Preparation of the Interviewers**

Four National Interviewers have been selected based on their experience with qualitative studies and their understanding of gender issues.

A 3-days preparation and training course has been carried out focusing on the methodology of semi-structured interviews, key questions to ask, the use of tape recorders and the way to transcribe the interviews. Additionally, an introduction to gender issues, gender mainstreaming and gender policies (Gender Strategy, Gender Plan of Action), and existing gender related groups (CFAW, Women Trade Committee, Gender Task Force etc) has been given.

The interview guidelines have been discussed, pre-tested and adjusted (*see annex 1*).

## **II. Focus Group Discussions**

One focus group discussion with 9 leaders and decision makers has been carried out in Hanoi and 2 group discussions with 23 civil servants (technical, research, commercial staff and teachers) have been carried out in Hanoi and Ho Chi Minh City. The 27 participating units are listed in annex 3.

The discussions have been tape-recorded and transcribed.

Discussions with leaders were mainly focusing on ideas and needs regarding the gender policy and mainstreaming process whereas discussions with technical staff were more related to gender issues in the daily work. Men and women of the staff group were asked to discuss existing problems separately in sub-groups in order to avoid biased opinions. After the presentation of their findings to the whole group, the sub-groups were asked to find solution to the problems mentioned by the other sex. Participants were highly motivated and interested and appreciated the participatory methodology.

## **III. Logistics and Experience with the Interviews**

The different units under MARD were asked to participate in the study and to provide a certain number of interviewees according to the described selection criteria (*see above*) on a fixed day. For reconfirming and arranging the time of the interview, the candidates

were contacted directly by the interviewers. The arrangement of the time schedule posed a problem in several cases as interviewees were called for office duties in short-noticed way, especially civil servants in leadership positions. The time schedule could therefore not be strictly followed but interviewers had to be highly flexible and postpone and re-arrange the interviews.

The interviewers' flexibility and their understanding regarding the subject matter and the objective of the study were of high importance for the outcome of the study.

Except for some few cases the acceptance of tape recorders was good. Some of the interviewees were reluctant to talk openly gender being a sensitive issue and some others did not express their own opinions but the politically correct ideas

## **B. Results**

**The problems, needs and opinions expressed in this chapter are described as they have been collected during the interviews and do not contain any comment of the Team of Consultants.**

---

### **Preliminary explanations regarding the citations:**

#### ***By "Leaders" it is referred to:***

- directors or vice-directors of the departments, institutes, schools and enterprises
- Chairmen of Mass Organizations
- head of offices and sections are not included

#### ***By "Staff" it is referred to:***

Technical staff, Researchers, Teachers, Commercial staff, Administrative staff, Support staff

## **I. Personnel organization**

According to the opinion of the interviewees, four main points are important for gender mainstreaming into personnel organization: To set up a percentage for recruitment of female staffs for each unit and office, to insure that enough salary and bonus payments are available for all staff members, to support women to be promoted into higher positions and to make sure that both male and female staff have access to all social benefits.



## **1. Data collection**

There is a lack of data on female civil servants under MARD regarding their exact number, their quality, their training level, their professional know-how and their qualification for their job. At present, merely some data exist on women in leadership positions. No figures about the business sector under MARD and about the problems due to the changes of the company status are accessible. A quantitative survey should be carried to find out the facts and to use the information for improved human resource management.

## **2. Recruitment**

There is a general preference to recruit men instead of women. The problem of nepotism in recruitment procedures has been mentioned several times.

The recruitment panel should not only consist in personnel department staff and leaders but external experts should be hired to evaluate the capacities of the candidates in a specific technical subject matter.

The indicators in the Gender Plan of Action for the recruitment of female staff<sup>1</sup> are too idealistic and this will discourage the units under MARD from taking any action. Some persons might be aware of gender equity and equality but in practice they are not considered in the recruitment procedures. To facilitate the recruitment of female staff an interviewee suggested adding 0.5 or 1 points for women to the final note at the entrance test for civil servants. According to other opinions the recruitment criteria must be equal for both women and men. Women should not be prioritized just because of their sex and the first selection criterion should be the skills and the capacity of a person. Nevertheless, to improve the progress towards gender equality a fixed and feasible percentage of new female staffing should be agreed upon taking in consideration the individual situation of each unit or section. Directives and regulations should be set up to encourage the decision making panels to recruit women.

New regulations on the entry examination for civil servants should be set up. The examination should be carried out regularly every year or every two years for a calculated amount of positions which will become vacant. There should be more open and detailed information on upcoming vacancies to avoid that interested candidates are hoping and waiting for the acceptance to be civil servants for several years or in vane.

## **3. Job assignments**

There should be a re-evaluation and a re-organization of all civil servants in all units. MARD needs to assess the performance of civil servants by setting up and institutionalizing a staff evaluation system in order to identify lacking skills and to strengthen them. Civil servants should be made responsible for the outcome of their work. The methods used at present for the annual self-evaluation of staff members are not

---

<sup>1</sup> 20-30% of the officials newly appointed at all levels from 2004 onwards are women

based on objective criteria. Evaluation of staff should be based on exact terms of reference and staff members who do not satisfy the criteria should be retrained, moved to other positions or encouraged to retire earlier. Incentives for good training results and improvement of the professional skills should be created. In general, leaders should always try to assign responsibilities to their staff members according to their capacity and knowledge but it has been emphasized by several interviewees that *“there must be job descriptions for each position and the suitable staff must be chosen based on the job descriptions and not the other way round to chose the person first and then create a suitable job.”* (man, 34 years, head of section, enterprise)

Job assignments and tasks for all positions in the units under MARD are not detailed and clear job descriptions about the exact position in the office, the duties, the requirements regarding professional skills, professional background and experience, the location, and the time must be designed. Training in personnel management and in the design of gender-responsive job descriptions should be organized by the PAR Project for the staff members of DOP.

Administrative staff should rotate between the different positions every two years for getting a comprehensive knowledge of the office system and to be able to replace colleagues in case of maternity or sick leave.

## **4. Promotion and Career**

### **4.1. Constraints for promotion**

Several limitations for the promotion of women have been mentioned by the interviewees:

- The attitude of leaders who do not believe in the capacity of female staff and in their available time for duties in higher positions. Men are in general preferred to women even if they have the same knowledge and skills. The fact that a part of the work of leaders takes place after office hours in parties and social events is perceived as not being suitable for women.
- The lack of motivation and the inferiority complex of women: *“Women have often an inferiority complex, and ask the leaders to wait to promote them as they are afraid and the leaders have a reason to say: ‘I talked with her directly [about the promotion] but she told me that she does not have enough experience’.. And then the leaders forget her”*(woman, 54 years, head of sub-CFAW, enterprise). Expectations towards women in higher positions are high and make women feel under pressure and many mentioned that a woman needs to work twice as hard as a man to be acknowledged. *“The female civil servants here don't want to become school leaders because the position includes too many problems and too much pressure; we try to become head of section. That is enough. [...] if a woman does not want to be a leader but is promoted to this position [against her will] her work will not be very effective”* and the higher position would comprise too much stress and pressure. *“Many women are very good in their profession and then leaders want to promote them into higher positions thinking that they can do well. But some of them don't want*

*and don't like to be promoted so finally their motivation will be reduced.*" (woman, 47 years, teacher, secondary and vocational school)

- The attitude of the husbands: Many women do not want to be promoted higher than head of section as it would lead to disagreement with their husband and to troubles in the family life. *"After being trained some women sacrifice their family life for their career and it results in broken families."* (man, 34 years, head of section, enterprise)
- The age for promotion for women is limited at 50 years<sup>2</sup> combined with an early retirement age of 55 years. *"The limitation of age is the biggest constraint for the promotion of women"* (group discussions HCMC). At this age women could have enough work experience and skills to be promoted to a leadership position and less family constraints as their children have grown up.
- Poor health conditions

In the present system, the promotion to a higher salary grade is made every three years. After several years of work and having reached a certain fixed salary grade and at least a Master degree, civil servants can undergo an examination for senior positions after having attended a training course (under supervision of MoHA). This fixed salary grade is in general attained at a later stage in the professional life of a civil servant to the disadvantage of women who will be promoted to senior staff at an age where further promotions to leadership positions are limited. At present the requisites for examinations for senior positions are a Master degree and a salary grade of 2.82 which is achieved after several working years. This leads to inequality as women have less time to work in senior positions as they retire five years earlier than men. Additionally, the pension is based on the last salary level during the working time and is therefore less for women. The interviewees suggested therefore reducing the required working time for promotions to a senior position for female staff.

#### **4.2. Career planning**

From the analysis of the interview transcription it becomes clear that the term "career planning" is not well understood by many civil servants as some mention that career planning would lead to jealousy by colleagues and pressure for the person who has to be selected to make career.

According to many interviewees, career planning should start from the recruitment of civil servants and should be done in a long-term view to prepare slowly men and especially women for leadership positions. Female staff members should be observed from the beginning of their professional life to find out their aspirations, motivations and ability, and should be supported gradually and be given the opportunity for upgrading professional training. Career planning must include the preparation and training of women on management skills and politics for future leadership positions. The selection criteria for promotion should not be biased by the sex of a civil servant but must be the same for men and women. *"The fixed percentage of women to be promoted into higher*

---

<sup>2</sup> Maximum promotion age: women 50 years/men 55 years; Retirement age: Women 55 years/men 60 years

*positions must be reviewed. What for? If the aim is to select leaders we have to chose a person who meets the criteria A, B, C etc. We have to base the selection on the main criteria and chose the persons according to their suitability, not based on the fact that it is a man or a woman. [...] If things are only set up pro-forma it doesn't have any sense.”* (man, 49 years, head of section, Cuc department)

Promotion must be planned carefully as some offices have promoted women into leadership positions despite their lacking capacity. The Department of Organization and Personnel being responsible for human resources management must be directly interested in this concern: *“My expectation is that the Department of Organization and Personnel is interested in this work because it is the department for human resources management and has to evaluate and inspect in order to learn lessons from experiences.”* (man, 59 years, leader, mass organization). Male and female civil servants should be first assessed and then trained, tested, appointed, monitored and evaluated on the basis of the requirements of the individual office.

Women should present their ideas to the leaders and make them understand about their needs to receive suitable support.

At present, women are absent from leadership position in nearly all units and there is no female vice-minister. The capacity of female leaders in MARD should be improved in order to achieve at least the appointment of one female vice-minister. There should be more women in leadership positions having enough authority to support gender equality and one interviewee even wondered *“why does the Government not nominate a female vice-minister for every ministry as chairperson of CFAW?”* (man, 48 years, staff, Vu department)

The targets set up in the Gender Strategy regarding the promotion of women cannot match with the reality as most of the leadership positions are occupied and there are no changes in staffing planned for the next future. The personnel policies and the organization on personnel and have not been considered in the design of the Gender Strategy and the POA and the targets are therefore unachievable. Career planning for female leaders must fit in the career plans for the offices. In many units there are not enough women or they do not meet the criteria for leadership positions. *“I think that the plan [of the gender strategy] is not feasible. They decide a percentage for female leadership for some positions of MARD but where are the [suitable] human resources?”* (man, 50 years, leader, department)

Targets and indicators on personnel issues in the POA need to be carefully and exactly evaluated and should be more elaborated, e.g. give details on the positions to be filled by a certain percentage of women.

Some women would have good skills and capacity for leadership positions but are too old to get a promotion<sup>3</sup>. In order to integrate women into career planning the capacity of female civil servants in each office should be determined and improved according to the needs. It must be part of the personnel policy to help female staff to gain more self-confidence, and to assign responsibilities to them according to their capacity.

---

<sup>3</sup> Maximum promotion age for women is 50 and for men 55 years.

## **5. Professional Training**

- The training of civil servants is a long process and should start from the beginning of the professional life and be carried out regularly to gradually build up capacity. Many interviewees emphasized that the selection for upgrading professional training is not depending on the sex but on the requirements for a position. Women should not rely on a fixed ratio to have access to training but should try “*to give their best*”.
- The main constraints for many women to have access to upgrading training are their family duties, their husbands and the location of the training courses.
- Many interviewees have suggested giving the opportunity to female staff to attend upgrading professional training and foreign language classes during office hours if they can fulfill their duties. There should be some incentives for female staff for attending professional upgrading course in evening classes to help them improving their skills. Leaders should motivate their staff in improving their skills and there should be incentives for postgraduate courses. In the University for Forestry for example, all teaching personnel (regardless the sex) have to take a Master Course after two years from the beginning of their recruitment and learn foreign languages. Administrative and support staff of schools and institutes have less opportunities for upgrading training and should be supported to attend training courses and be included into the training plan of the office.
- In order to make women gain more self-confidence professional training courses should include group work for focused discussions or elaboration of a subject followed by a presentation to all participants.
- Female researchers find it difficult to get academic titles as they cannot meet the requested criteria (e.g. number of hours teaching) because of time constraints due to their work and family duties.
- In agricultural extension courses the participation of female farmers is low as there is no interest and commitment of staff to fix a minimum percentage of female attendance and to keep to it. Compulsory targets and criteria for the participation of women in extension training courses should be fixed at local level according to the local situation and to the course content. The direct responsible leaders should give exact instructions, hold their staff accountable and control the implementation on a regular basis.

## **6. Salaries**

Salaries should be based on the position, the responsibility and the capacity and not according to the time period worked. The units under MARD should have the possibilities to have separate policies to adjust the salary level according to the position.

## II. Social benefits

The questions on social benefits have not been asked in an in-depth way as it was not objective of the study. Nevertheless, following opinions have been collected:

Social benefits are mainly drafted by men and do not address properly women's needs. The participation of women in decisions on social benefits should be assured in order to achieve gender equality.

### 1. Health care

At present the health examinations for female civil servants offered by MARD are not regularly carried out. The medical examination for women should be carried out regularly once a year and should be of good quality.

### 2. Maternity and child care leave

- The society expects from women to procreate but this leads to disadvantages in their work regarding bonus points: the absence from work of four months during their maternity leave will negatively influence the yearly evaluation and will not allow them to receive a bonus payment like other staff. The same problem is reported for the child care leave and should be discussed and improved.
- Child care leave is only allowed for women. "*Why can only the mother take leave when the child is sick and the husband not?*" (woman, 52, leader, mass organization)
- Women in the business branches under MARD mentioned that their substitutes during the maternity leave will carry out their job less effectively as they are not familiar with it. This will result in more work for the women after the maternity leave. Replacements with sufficient skills should be assigned.

### 3. Retirement

Many different opinions regarding the retirement age have been mentioned:

- The retirement age should be equal for men and women.
- Retirement age should be 60 for both women and men but with option to retire earlier
- Women having a good capacity and professional skills should not retire at 55. The retirement age should be fixed but there should be the possibility to extend the work as consultants.
- Retirement age should be possible earlier than 55 for labor forces in the business branches due to poor health conditions.
- The present retirement age is 55 years for women and 60 year for men. But the time period for contributions to social insurance is the same for both sexes (30 years) and should be reduced for women.

### III. Family and Work

- Women have more workload due to their devotion to their husband and their family in addition to their work. Despite the existing policies for women, the traditional way of thinking and the patriarchal behavior is still very strong. Women working in intellectual or technical environments would often like to show the image of a modern woman in society and do not dare talking about their constraints with traditional believes and the workload.
- The idea of setting up a kinder garden has been mentioned for agricultural farms belonging to the business branches where female workers living in remote locations do not have the access to a child care alternative. An example of a successful implementation in a company under the Corporation for Fruits, Vegetables and Agricultural Products has been given. There should be support from MARD to set up these kinder gardens in cooperation with the local Education and Training office. In some schools under MARD having a lot of female teachers kinder gardens have already been established but should be improved. This could be done with a private investment or through the collection of a monthly fee from the staff members with assistance from the Trade Union. MARD should support these initiatives.
- Examples of small but efficient changes in personnel decisions have been given from schools where leaders have arranged a more suitable time schedule for female teachers with small children to help them conciliating their work with their child care duties. It is important to raise the awareness of MARD leaders and to make them understand and support the staff members in their daily life. *“I think that gender awareness has to reach each family and each man for them to understand the situation of women in the office and in the family.”* (woman, 35 years, teacher, university)

### IV. Working environment

- In the productive units under MARD restrooms and changing rooms for men and especially female staff should be made available, controlled and improved.
- Separate rooms for lunch breaks for women should be offered especially at local level when the working place is at a long distance from home.
- Meat inspection in slaughterhouses for female veterinarian is difficult and dangerous due to the rough conditions and attitudes of the butchers. The security of women should be ensured or only men should be sent to work in these locations.
- Regulations for pregnant women on work with harmful substances are not adequate and should be reviewed and their implementation strictly controlled.

## V. Organizational Structure

There is a problem of communication and coordination between the different departments of MARD. The miscommunication between the central level and the representative offices of Cuc departments in the South is resulting in lack of clear duties, responsibilities and guidance in their work. *“In the system of our Department, if you can eliminate this representative office, then do it. If not then think what to do with us.”* (man, 50 years, staff, Cuc department)

The lack of clear assignments of responsibilities to the departments hinders also the implementation of activities regarding human resources and gender mainstreaming.

The planning capacity of staff is low and the lack of data on human resources at local level makes planning difficult. It is hoped that the new personnel management information system (PMIS) supported by the PAR Project will effectively work for the benefit of both male and female civil servants. MARD should set up regulations and enforce the data collection system as there is only low feed-back from the units and the local level.

## VI. Gender Awareness and Training

### 1. Awareness raising

Changing of attitudes in adults is difficult and awareness raising should therefore start at young age. *“We have to train all men to make them understand clearly that women have a lot of workload because it is the general believe that women have to be like this and they have to be at the service of their husband.”* (man, 35 years, v-head of section, Cuc department)

A budget should be allocated for a generalized awareness raising campaign in MARD. *“For gender equality especially men and leaders have to change their thinking. There is a lot of talking but there is still the strong believe that men are the ancient tree and the women are the servants and the grass under the tree.”* (Focus group discussions; women sub-group; HCMC)

The attitude of MARD leaders at all levels needs to change to give an example to other men: *“If CFAW wants gender quality it has to start with the leaders. If in the ministry they do not care about gender it will continue to be the same at lower levels [...] therefore, the best solution is to start with the leaders. If the leaders are good their civil servants will follow.”* (woman, 52 years, leader, mass organization)

For general awareness raising all over the country but especially in the rural areas mass media are believed to be more effective than manuals, books or leaflets. Gender issues should be integrated into agricultural extension activities and training material (e.g. by using more pictures with female farmers).

Following activities have been suggested for the PAR Project:



- A competition on the awareness and knowledge about gender issues could be organized to raise the interest of civil servants (as it has been done for the knowledge on public administration reform).
- The PAR Project could distribute a monthly bulletin on gender issues and the public administration reform process or publish regularly articles in the MARD magazine.
- A workshop should be organized after the completion of this gender study to give feedback at least to the participating offices and to suggest a priority list of gender activities.

## **2. Gender training**

Gender issues should not be treated in separated training courses as many people will not be interested in attending them due to common prejudices. For higher effectiveness, they should be integrated into the training plans of upgrading professional training courses (e.g. one week training course could include ½ day or more on gender concepts). Additionally, gender could be integrated with some small topics or ideas and limited time into workshops and seminars instead of organizing big and costly workshops on gender awareness only. *"They will listen little by little [...] that is better than listening only once for a long time"* (woman, 53 years, leader, business enterprise). It has been suggested that for MARD or DARD leaders, gender issues could be integrated into meetings with topics that meet a lot of interest like *"Marketing of agricultural products in ASEAN countries"*. By integrating gender issues into courses and workshops, civil servants would gradually get used to a new way of thinking. Examples were mentioned on professional training courses abroad where gender is integrated in the different subject matters (e.g. role of women in reduction of natural disasters, role of old people...) and where the staff members have learnt how to integrate gender into professional activities after having carried out a needs assessment. An opposite opinion was mentioned only by one woman who suggested that gender issues should not be integrated in professional training in departments where only men work. According to her gender concerns only women and training should be carried out only for female staff.

Gender should be recognized as a subject and as examination topic in the training curriculum for all civil servants at the management schools. MARD should cooperate with MoHA to issue an official decision and to establish the necessary budget plan. By integrating gender into the training courses for civil servants it can be shown that gender concepts belong to the professional duties and that they are not only confined to be a social activity.

### **2.1. Training Methodology**

Many interviewees suggested that gender trainers should use participatory methodology and should be able to present the issues in an appealing way to raise interest in the participants. Training should be organized as much as possible in group work activities or discussion groups to make participants actively involved and interested. In order to be

able to carry out training in a participatory approach the number of attendants should be limited to a maximum of 30 persons.

A detailed training plan should be set up and the training budget should include follow-up activities as one training session only is not perceived as being sufficient. Gender training should not be carried out in one block but the training plan should be set up for several short lessons building up on each other. This would attract more participants and make the attendance easier. There should be also male trainers to avoid giving the impression that gender is a topic concerning only women.

## **2.2. Training material**

There is a lack in documents on gender issues, existing documents are not distributed and not made available and there is only few or no information provided. *“We haven’t received any documents yet. The woman who is responsible for gender issues has taken part in the meeting and has received one document for herself. We only know what she tells us, but in fact we don’t have any further documents or information.”* (woman, 38 years, staff, Vu department)

Existing documents for gender training and gender awareness should be revised and standardized. *“The PAR project has carried out a workshop on gender equality already. I read the document they distributed but I did not understand some of the issues, so how is it possible to use this document for integrating gender?”* (woman, 51 years, staff, Cuc department)

In general, the documents should be short and focused and not be *“thick books that nobody wants to read”*.

The relevant information on gender concepts should be selected by the responsible persons of CFAW and be made available on the MARD intranet to all civil servants.

## **2.3. Training content**

The content of the gender training courses is for many civil servants difficult to understand as it is too abstract. *“The teacher was very motivated, the content was rich but the female teacher was westernized and used some very strange words that the participants could not understand, but nobody dared to ask as they were too shy.”* (man, 59 years, leader, mass organization). The training topics should be more practice oriented and a practical linkage with the professional activities should be made.

The content needs to be adapted to the different education levels of civil servants and must be made attractive for these different levels. Many course attendants think that the content should be presented in a more appealing way to be effective: *“Some people have attended the training course once. When they were invited to attend a second time they did not accept to go because they think that the training is too boring”*. (woman, 53 years, leader, enterprise)

Furthermore, there should be different training topics for leaders, staff and CFAW members. The training content for leaders should focus on the way to mainstream gender, on skills to plan gender integration and to implement policies whereas the staff should receive training on gender issues regarding their daily work. For the business branches under MARD the content of the training course should be short and focused due to time constraints.

Some interviewees suggested organizing study tours for leaders to see and learn from countries which successfully mainstream gender.

The PAR project should assist in the design of a gender training plan. It has been suggested to hire international experts to improve the training content and to train the trainers. However, the content of gender training of foreign countries should be critically reviewed and adapted to the local situation and the rural and agricultural sector in Vietnam. Gender training should be carried out by Vietnamese teachers as the presentation by foreigners has been perceived as being too abstract.

#### **2.4. Participants**

Many interviewees were interested in attending a gender training course. Women report that gender training has been important for them to make them feel more self-confident. Especially young women should be trained to help them reducing their inferiority complex.

In general, the participation of female staff in gender training courses is higher than men as invitations are mainly sent to women and men are less interested in the subject thinking it concerns only women. The participants of the group discussion in Ho Chi Minh City reported that men do not have the opportunity to participate in gender training courses: *“We have not yet heard about gender, we haven’t received any gender training. In general gender is perceived as being a program to improve the situation of women, in general people don’t know that gender problems cover both men and women and the problems in the society. We have not yet had training on gender and we do not understand a lot about gender.”* (focus group discussions, men group, HCMC)

Leaders are rarely attending gender training courses due to their busy time schedule. They send other staff on their behalf or do not really follow the course actively which reduces the effectiveness: *“I have to deal with dozens of official documents every day. I went to the gender training course but I don’t remember anything.”* (man, 51 years, leader, Vu department)

To make gender mainstreaming successful all civil servants including women, men and especially leaders and decision makers should attend gender training courses. *“For example whenever there is a gender training course all leaders send the women on their behalf [...] that makes us very sad. The awareness of leaders is of highest importance.”* (group discussions with leaders, Hanoi)

Most of the interviewees expressed the opinion that the awareness and the training of leaders is of utmost importance for the effectiveness of gender mainstreaming and that gender training must be compulsory for leaders. *“Training for leaders should be carried out first followed by the training for staff”.* (woman, 51 years, head of section, department, sub-CFAW member)

The awareness of leaders must be raised *“starting from the very beginning of the training of civil servants, to the public administration management training course and the advanced politics courses. Gender needs to be integrated in the curricula of these training courses. If you try to change their mind when the persons are already in leadership positions it is too late.”* (woman, 38 years, head of section, enterprise)

Training for high level leaders on gender must be compulsory and they should not be allowed to send somebody else on their behalf: *“When you invite the highest leaders [men] to gender training, they will send somebody else on their behalf. You have to carry out separate and focused gender training courses only for Chairmen, General Directors and Secretaries of the Communist Party and do not permit women to attend.”* (woman, 64 years, sub-CFAW, enterprise)

In contrast to this widespread opinion, only one interviewee thought that leaders are very busy and cannot attend gender training and it would therefore be better to give them the training documents to read.

Both female and male should be trained on gender but there should be separated classes for leaders and staff. The idea to separate training depending on the age of civil servants (under 30 years and above) has also been mentioned.

Training should be also carried out for CFAW and sub-CFAW leaders who still have a low gender awareness and lack skills and knowledge about gender equality and gender mainstreaming. The training output should be a satisfactory knowledge on gender issues and on how to integrate gender in the work.

There is an urgent need to train civil servants working in the extension sector to make them use the acquired knowledge in their work with farmers. These training courses should be short and contain several practical examples. Leaders of extension centers at all levels should also be trained to understand the concepts and to give guidance to their staff members.

## **2.5. Training organization and logistics**

Several interviewees suggested introducing an official certificate in gender training as requisite for promotion to higher positions as it is the case for the certificate in foreign languages or informatics: *“Before becoming a leader you must attend a gender training course like the politics classes to be aware of gender issues. That would be good.”* (woman, 55 years, staff, department)

With the aim of giving more importance to the gender training courses and making more civil servants attend, the invitations for leaders of departments, institutes, schools and companies should be signed by high-level leaders or the Communist Party and should be announced as training courses of MARD and not only of CFAW. Invitations for sections inside the departments should be signed by the department leaders themselves.

In order to avoid the repeated attendance of the same participants at gender training courses the invitation should be personalized and not be made only for the position. The attendance should be controlled and should be compulsory.

The timing for training courses should be planned together with the leaders of the units to avoid busy moments of the year. For companies and corporations being very busy in agricultural production seasons, the timing of the training course should be planned carefully with their leaders in accordance with the seasons. Training should be carried out in the company/corporation compound to avoid time loss with transportation and to address a larger audience.

### 3. Mainstreaming into Schools under MARD

#### 3.1. Teaching curricula

Before adding gender to curricula lessons should be learnt from other countries. Gender integration into curricula should be tested in one class of university students in form of a pilot program and then improved after having learnt from the experience and having received feed-back from the students.

Some interviewees expressed their concern about the possible reduction of the content of the lectures on professional and technical subjects due to the introduction of gender issues. Gender should therefore be treated as a separate subject (with e.g. 45 to 60 teaching units).

Opinions on the possible integration of gender into curricula included following subjects:

- Civil education
- Politics, social responsibilities and laws (e.g. labor rights; laws concerning the individual, the family and the society)
- Introduction week to politics at the beginning of each semester
- Philosophy

Many interviewees expressed the opinion that it would be difficult to integrate gender issues into technical subjects. Nevertheless, some examples for gender consideration within technical subject matters have been given: In the Social Forestry Center<sup>4</sup> belonging to the University of Forestry some subjects on gender have been introduced in teaching and research subjects such as the role of women in community forestry, forest protection and non-timber products processing. Additionally, gender considerations could be integrated into the teaching curricula of social forestry, rural investigation, agricultural and forestry extension and farm household economics.

Examples have been given by teachers for introduction of gender issues into financial and state budget management and organization of other intra and extra-curricular activities to make the students “learning by doing”: *“We want to give a basis to female students to be self-confident. We don't say any word about the ways how to behave but the activities themselves can help female students to affirm their role and not to feel less worth than men.”* (woman, 47 years, director of department, secondary and vocational school) For example, female students are encouraged to design a program and present it to the class to make their confidence increase and to make male students get used to appreciate the capacity of women.

In universities and vocational schools sitting places should be mixed for male and female students.

The Department of Organization and Personnel should cooperate with the Management Schools regarding the integration of gender subjects into training curricula for civil servants and submit a proposal including a budget plan to MARD. The content should vary according to the different levels of civil servants.

---

<sup>4</sup> Supported by Helvetas

### **3.2. Teachers**

Teachers are lacking awareness and skills on integrating gender in lectures and on appropriate teaching methodology. A ToT program to strengthen their capacity should be carried out. The integration of gender into universities should be a smooth process and the teachers' knowledge and willingness must be improved through awareness campaigns. There should be a specialized and trained working group for integrating gender into schools and for training of the staff.

Gender training of the teachers must be compulsory but needs to be adapted to different kind of responsibilities: While teachers being responsible for the administration and management will need to attend a regular gender training, those staff who are directly involved in teaching activities need to attend more detailed and in-depth gender training. Additionally, the training should also involve the members of mass organizations of the schools to ensure their support.

School leaders should encourage female teachers to draw a plan for extra-curricular activities regarding gender such as competitions, plays, clubs, workshops etc. These activities could be carried out with the support and in cooperation with the different mass organizations and the sub-CFAW.

The general attitude towards schools and universities must change. They must be seen as service providers and must be responsible for the quality of teaching and the methodology. Teachers have to improve their teaching skills and their knowledge regularly. External specialists for specific intervention should be hired which would be in accordance with the Government Decision CP 116 allowing governmental offices to contract external staff.

Gender awareness has to be focused especially on the young generation to grow up with these ideas and interiorize them. It should be therefore integrated into all school (starting from primary schools) and universities curricula.

## **VII. Gender policies**

Gender issues are not integrated in state regulations and decisions. Although policies exist they are not matching with the present attitude and thinking of the society. None of the existing policies of MARD are mainstreamed and should be reviewed as men and women have different situations and vocations.

Gender mainstreaming must be a smooth process to avoid being perceived as a feminist movement.

### **1. Information**

*“If you want to set up an action plan for your office you have to base on the Plan of Action of MARD CFAW. How to do if they don't give you the necessary information?”*

*This is a constraint; you cannot do anything without that information.*” (woman, 51 years, head of section, department, sub-CFAW). The information about the Gender Strategy needs to be largely diffused as many civil servants are not aware of its existence due to lack of information and interest. *“The people [in the offices] are only interested in the women’s days on 8 March and 20 October for socializing and offering flowers [...] or sometimes something bigger, but there is not yet any movement or encouragement of women to work better or any orientation for their life.”* (woman, 42 years, staff, Vu department)

A big workshop should be conducted with many participants including leaders of all units under MARD and (sub-)CFAW members in order to introduce the Gender Strategy and Gender Plan of Action. Further on, group discussions should be organized to discuss separate issues more in detail according to the different responsibilities and levels.

## **2. Commitment**

The Gender Plan of Action is not being successfully implemented as there is low interest and lack of commitment and enforcement: *“If they want they will implement it and if they don't want they won't do it. And whenever one office tries to carry out some activities there is neither monitoring nor evaluation carried out”* and the activities are therefore less effective. (woman, 48 years, head of section, department)

When a strategy is approved, key-leaders must commit to the implementation of the action plan and its activities as a part of their duty. *“If the Minister signs the Gender Plan of Action, it has the same value as the other decisions, and it has to be discussed, and the figures of the assignments must be decided and gender must be mainstreamed into the plans of every office [...] The Ministry has issued this document, and has to make sure that it is implemented strictly and has to control and supervise it.”* (woman, 45 years, staff, Cuc Department)

The general lack of interest of leaders towards gender issues becomes obvious by the fact that gender mainstreaming is not even worth to be a content of a meeting. *“Gender is a difficult issue mainly due to the low awareness of leaders; this is like a big concrete block...”* (man, 49 years, school director). It is not sufficient only assuring their support, all leaders including the ministers should be trained on gender issues and commit to the implementation of the strategy and the action plan and make sure that the activities are monitored and evaluated. Gender issues must be part of the meetings of the Communist Party and of the key-leaders.

## **3. Design and Implementation of Gender Policies**

Despite the appreciation by NCFW for the design of the gender strategy of MARD the indicators are not realistic and feasible. Only few activities have been carried out: *“We are facing a long distance between planning and implementing. [...] Now, in fact, the effect of the decisions is none and void.”* (woman, 50 years, leader, Vu department) The constraints are the lack of support of MARD and the lack of cooperation between authorities, the Communist Party and other official groups.

The Gender Strategy and the POA for the agricultural and rural development sector are based on indicators of the National Strategy and not on the reality in MARD and its units. *“If you set up something you have to consider both the activities and the right conditions*

*to work. But in fact they have too many ambitions; they set up a lot of duties but cannot provide the conditions to make it work. If it is like this we cannot do anything even if we were gods! [...] Instead of quantity we should think about quality.*" (woman, 51 years, leader, Vu department)

The POA is difficult to implement and can only be put into action step by step as the indicators have not been integrated in the activity plans of the departments and units yet. Some indicators cannot be implemented as they are not matching with the personnel policies of MARD. The indicators are too idealistic and too general (e.g. 30% of women are part of the management board but without specification at which level). *"The gender action plan issued by CFAW is too general. They suggest targets of women in the management board but if there is no quality then how to be a good leader?"* (woman, 48 years, head of section, Institute)

In the Year 2005 a final evaluation of the Plan of Action should be carried out to learn from experiences and to suggest changes (especially on human resource management issues) for the design of a new POA. The Gender Strategy and the Action Plan for the agriculture and rural development sector needs to be designed in a bottom-up approach and has to include the contribution of all units at central and local level to create ownership. In order to improve the feasibility of the future POA the documents should be distributed to all units and sections to receive feed-back and to integrate their ideas. Opinions from all units from both men and women are needed to design a feasible action plan. Leaders of all levels have to take part in designing the POA as they are the persons who really guide, lead and implement. Leaders should be trained in gender awareness and in implementation skills for the POA.

Indicators must be feasible and the implementation must be decided by the key-leaders and integrated into the MARD evaluation system to make people feel committed.

Targets must be set up flexibly together with the different units. The Department of Organization and Personnel should cooperate with the different units to take feasible decisions on indicators regarding training, recruitment and promotion. Additionally, the Trade Union should participate in the design of the action plan: *"It is very difficult to care about the rights of the female civil servants without the representative of the TU in the CFAW [...]. They set up the indicators in the gender action plan themselves without the participation of the ministerial trade union."* (woman, 54 years, leader, mass organization)

The specific needs of the different sectors and the different locations should be determined in order to find appropriate solutions on gender for the different situations. *"PAR in MARD should conduct seminars to collect the opinions and expectations of female civil servants at all levels and make a more feasible action plan [...] The administration reform has to consider the hopes and expectations of the people, take them as a pillar for building up the system..."* (woman, 38 years, staff, mass organization)

Instead of indicators job description need to be designed and following questions should be asked: How many women meet the criteria? What is needed to improve their capacity? How to support successfully women who are motivated to make career?

Whereas the design of gender policies should be a bottom-up approach, the gender mainstreaming process should be top down and enforced by the key-leaders. For gender mainstreaming it is considered as important to design policies, to allocate budgets and to



raise awareness. Gender mainstreaming should be an important part of the political duties of a civil servant. Time, committed members and a financial basis are seen as essential for gender mainstreaming. The implementation of the POA should be enforced through directives from higher level. *“In my opinion to make the targets work you need guidelines from higher level. It is like solving a mathematic problem: you need a formula.”* (man, 51 years, leader, university)

Models for gender mainstreaming should be developed and tested in some departments and experience should be shared with other ministries to learn from them. CFAW and sub-CFAW members would have to assist in implementing these pilot programs regularly and directly. In order to be able to follow up the pilot sites the capacity of CFAW and sub-CFAW members should be strengthened in compulsory training courses. Study tours to other countries having a successful gender mainstream should be offered to leaders to learn from their experience.

#### **4. Monitoring and Evaluation**

The POA has been agreed upon since one year and activities needs now to be evaluated, and adjusted to focus on few feasible priorities. Monitoring and evaluation of the implementation must be enforced and must be carried out on schedule as planned: *“MARD has to take strong measures for the control”* (woman, 44 years, leader, mass organization) A working group should be responsible for the control and the M&E.

MARD should organize a meeting with all leaders of all units and CFAW in order to assign the responsibilities and discuss the deadlines for each activity, and all decisions should be officially signed. In order to give importance to the meeting, the Communist Party has to chair it. At local level there should be meetings between the same groups of units (companies, institutes etc.) to have a common basis for discussion.

The departments and other units should design their own action plan as the POA is too general. MARD should motivate and support these activities and control the progress. Training and action plans for all Cuc and Vu departments should be decided upon with the objective to train all leaders in MARD until the end of 2004.

Sub-CFAW or gender working groups should be established not only at department level but also in sections in order to raise a broad awareness about gender issues and the action plan and to facilitate the mainstreaming process.

Activities of the POA have to be integrated in the activity plan of the different units and sections and discussed at the regular office meetings. The evaluation must be compulsory for all offices and activities have to be monitored regularly as part of the existing annual review of office activities. Civil servants who have successfully implemented gender activities should get appreciations from the leaders or rewards as an incentive.

Reports should be short and focused and reporting form for gender activities should be designed (how many women, knowledge level, promotions, requirements...) and made available.

## VIII. Gender related Groups

### 1. The Committee for the Advancement of Women (CFAW)

The name “Committee for Advancement of Women” is misleading as it is containing the wording “advancement of women” instead of “gender”. Therefore people tend to see it as a part of the women movements. CFAW should therefore be renamed if it wants to be taken seriously in its gender plans.

#### 1.1. Role of CFAW

CFAW is not known to all civil servants as the information of its establishment has not been largely diffused. *“We are here but have not yet received any information about the existence of CFAW. The information level is low and only few people are informed. If only few are aware of it then its activities will be limited and less effective.”* (man, 25 years, staff, department)

The role of CFAW is not well understood by many civil servants and there are controversial opinions about its function and usefulness: *“They say they want to reduce the personnel and reduce the bulky mass [in the ministry], so what to establish a new committee for? Why not asking a part of the Trade Union like the Women’s Trade Committee to cover this issue?”* (man, 44 years, head of section, enterprise). The question on the necessity of the sub-CFAW has been raised with the reasoning that MARD CFAW has already been established, gender policies have been issued and it is now up to the different units to integrate gender into their work.

The responsibilities and functions of (sub-) CFAW need to be clearly defined and a detailed working program with clear objectives should be set up. *“If [CFAW] is established and there is no clear role it is juts idle talking.”* (Focus group discussions, HCMC). CFAW should have an advisory role to the ministerial level, including the decision making process of MARD and the human resource management. The program of CFAW has to be considered as a program of MARD and not as a separate program. CFAW should have a close relationship with the female civil servants of MARD in order to understand their needs and their aspirations.

#### 1.2. Authority of CFAW

CFAW has no power to take decisions and to implement activities: *“For example, I am a leader; if my director assigns a duty to me it is different as if MARD CFAW assigns it to me. This is the reality.”* (man, 50 years, leader, enterprise). The efforts of CFAW cannot be successful as the implementation of activities depends on the goodwill and the support of the individual civil servants. *“When CFAW has set up its program, it has made a lot of noise. But after a while nobody supervised to make things happen.”* (woman, 54 years, leader, mass organization). The key-leaders have to be aware of the fact that CFAW is not a mass organization but an official body. *“In my opinion, the leaders of CFAW have to consider the CFAW activities as one important official duty and cannot say they are too busy. And they cannot give this reason or another reason to disregard this duty and focus only on other tasks.”* (woman, 54 years, leader, Institute). The CFAW network should be

supported by the leaders and the Communist Party at all levels and should be officially represented in the official administrative meetings (as it is the case for the Communist Party, the Trade Union and other official bodies) to gain more importance. Recent changes in positions at leadership level have led to a discontinuity in gender activities due to the time of adaptation. Therefore a meeting to introduce members and activities, and agree on a work plan would be desirable. There should be at least two CFAW meetings per year with the presence of all members.

The organizational and personnel structure of (sub-) CFAW should be reviewed and strengthened. *“Every small thing has to be asked for from the authorities, this committee [sub-CFAW] has nothing, no budget and the members are not fully responsible.”* (woman, 51 years, head of section, sub-CFAW). Sufficient budget for activities, transport, communication and other running costs should be allocated. *“There is no budget, but we have to encourage the women to report, but how can we encourage them any longer?”* (woman, 55 years, staff, Cuc department).

### **1.3. Sub-CFAWs**

- In several units under MARD sub-CFAWs have been created but they lack guidance from higher level regarding their duties and activities. *“We have established a sub-CFAW following the directives of MARD. But it is very difficult to design an action plan as MARD only gives a very vague, not detailed basis. [...] if it is only vague [...] there won't be any results.”* (man, 59 years, leader, enterprise)
- Recently established departments (e.g. National Agricultural Extension Center) and companies are still waiting for directives from higher level to create sub-CFAWs.
- Interviewees in the South complain about the low communication level between CFAW and the southern structures due to distance, lack of budget and lack of interest. When key-leaders from the central level visit the South they do not have gender issues on their agenda: *“I have not seen a head of CFAW here since longtime.”* (woman, 53 years, leader, mass organization)
- There is lack of dialog and cooperation between CFAW and the sub-CFAWs. In order to strengthen the sub-CFAW network one full-time member in CFAW should be responsible for coordinating and supervising the establishment and the work progress of the sub-CFAWs, giving them guidance and assisting in the design of detailed activity plans and objectives. M& E criteria should be set up and regular meetings (quarterly or half-yearly) should be organized between CFAW and sub-CFAWs to monitor the progress and learn from the different experiences. An evaluation system based on points should be set up for activities in the different offices. The PAR project could assist sub-CFAWs in setting up action plans and M&E schemes.
- Budget guidelines have only been issued for the sub-CFAWs of non-productive units but not for productive units yet. The business enterprises could in some cases allocate a budget to sub-CFAW on their own but are not able to take decisions as they lack specific directives from higher level.

- Budget should be made available to sub-CFAWS and the financial contribution should be shared by MARD, the Trade Union, and the unit itself.

#### 1.4. CFAW Members

It has been remarked that not even in CFAW there is gender equity as the members are in majority men.

CFAW members are part-time members and do not spend much time on CFAW activities as the priority is their main professional duty. *“That committee [CFAW] has a room near the Irrigation Department, I see that there is enough furniture but there is never anybody.”* (man, >45 years, head of section, mass organization). CFAW members have only little motivation to carry out their CFAW duties as there is no incentive, no clear objective, no work plan and no allowances for this extra-duty. *“At present all members of CFAW are only there to fill a position. They have to carry out their main duty in their office and take part additionally in CFAW only formally”.* (man, 47 years, staff, Vu department).

Terms of reference with exact duties and responsibilities must be designed for CFAW members, a detailed work plan agreed upon and indicators for M&E must be set. *“Maybe there are a lot of reasons for the ineffectiveness of MARD CFAW, however, whatever they do they are not specialized and it is therefore not done thoroughly, I say it straight forward. This is due to the part-time, if they want they do if they don’t want they leave it. The responsibility is not clearly assigned and they don’t have power. Our work is determined by the political duty, everyone does not more than his duty and his salary.”* (man, 50 years, leader, enterprise)

The PAR project could assist in a needs assessment for improved CFAW activities and in the design of a work plan.

Leaders of CFAW have a busy time schedule for their professional duties and are not committed. *“When I am invited to a meeting I attend it. But I am very busy and in fact I cannot concentrate on the meeting due to my workload. If the key-leaders are in CFAW but in fact it is only pro-forma then they will never create a concrete action plan.”* (man, 55 years, leader, Cuc department). The attendance of CFAW leaders in CFAW meetings must be compulsory.

The knowledge and skills of (sub-) CFAW leaders of members regarding gender equality and mainstreaming are still weak and need to be improved. PAR should assist CFAW in setting up a training plan.

Different ideas about the position of CFAW members have been collected:

- CFAW needs full-time members with a regular salary for assuring its effectiveness. Their duties should be to collect information, analyze it and advise the leaders on steps to be taken. The terms of reference for their position must be clear. Leaders must understand that the duty on gender concepts is as important as the other professional duties and support them.

- “I think that the team of MARD CFAW has to consist in full-time members. The vice-chairman has to be a permanent member. If not he or she has to be at least director of a department in order to have the authority towards lower levels.” (man, 59 years, leader, mass organization). The head of CFAW must be a high leader and the other members have to consist in representatives of DOP, Trade Union and Finance Department. By including members of the Communist Party, the WTC and TU the cooperation and the mutual support between these organizations in terms of gender issues could be facilitated.
- “We would like one more woman to work as vice-head of CFAW, only or mainly working on gender [...]. We have to add one more permanent vice-head.” (woman, 51 years, leader, Vu department)
- The position of (sub) CFAW leaders should be linked with prestige for his work: “I talk openly, if MARD requires one full-time responsible for CFAW nobody will agree to do it” as this position is not perceived as important and prestigious (man, 44 years, staff, Vu department).
- As it is difficult to conciliate the professional duty with the position of a permanent member, CFAW leaders should be part-time members and have advisers to assist them in their duty of CFAW. MARD needs to define the amount of time that members of CFAW and sub-CFAW have to spend on their job and on CFAW activities.
- Sub-CFAW members should be on part-time basis in order to be able to integrate directly CFAW activities in their daily work in the office.

## 2. Trade Union and Women’s Trade Committee

“In my opinion you can ask all women in our office which group is working for the advancement of women. They only know the Women’s Trade Committee but not the CFAW for sure.” (man, 45 years, head of section, department)

The WTC has a stronger network than the CFAW but its main tasks only regard women’s issues and not gender. “In reality the Women’s Trade Committee has more power than others as it takes part in many decisions as a member of the decision making panel”. (group discussion leaders, Hanoi)

The Trade Union has not been requested to take part in CFAW activities. There is no information, no cooperation and no coordination between CFAW and the Trade Union or the Women’s’ Trade Committee. “Generally speaking, there is no discussion and no cooperation existing. CFAW has a separate program.” (woman, 54 years, leader, mass organization)

CFAW should cooperate with the Trade Union and Women’s Trade Committee and representative of the Trade Union should be member of CFAW to make the gender mainstreaming efforts more efficient. The advantage of the Trade Union is that it has good relationships with the mass organizations (Women’s Union, Youth Union) and the Communist Party and is better organized than CFAW to transfer the gender information to all civil servants under MARD.

### 3. The Gender Taskforce

The Gender Taskforce has been established within the PAR Project with the aim of implementing and monitor gender mainstreaming activities in PAR in MARD but *“the Gender Taskforce has been established since February but they have only organized one meeting until July [...] I am a member of the Gender Taskforce but I could not take part in the meeting.”* (woman, 39 years, Vu department)

## IX. Companies

The priority for companies is the business. There are a lot of changes due to the privatization of state-owned companies and the regulations for civil servants will not be applicable any more for the employees.

The regulation Nr. 622 (National Tax Department) on tax reduction for enterprises employing more than a fixed percentage<sup>5</sup> of women has not been efficiently implemented and should be controlled and empowered *“This policy has been issued since many years but has not been implemented so please don't talk anymore about support!”* (woman, 53 years, leader, enterprise)

## C. Recommendations

### I. Recommendations for the PAR Project

#### Objective 1. Output 1.4

*Capacity of the “National Agricultural Extension Center” is improved with the orientation to public services delivery and be used as model for improving public service orientation for other agencies*

The results of the qualitative study show that there is a need for gender awareness for all civil servants in the extension sector.

- Carry out gender awareness training for central and provincial leaders of extension services with the aim to
  - make them understand the importance of gender consideration in the extension work
  - to take decisions regarding gender equality in extension services
  - to guide and encourage staff members

---

<sup>5</sup> Companies with 10 -100 employees and > 50% female staff; Companies with > 100 employees and > 30% female staff.

- Prepare and carry out participatory gender training for operational staff members for the practical use:
  - Organize training and group work to find out practical applications for the integration of gender issues into training contents and on how to design of suitable training material, pre-test it and re-adjust it.
  - Use the assessment of the planned baseline survey on the participation of female and male farmers in extension training to discuss adequate ways for the achievement of better results (training organization, planning etc)

### **Objective 2. Output 2.3**

*To support DOP to improve qualification of MARD's civil servants*

- Train DOP civil servants in practical application of gender concepts:
  - Additional to HR manual, carry out practice oriented and participatory training on human resource management and career plan development of civil servants and with special attention on the situation of female candidates (capacity, upgrading training, maternity leave, promotion age, and retirement age).
  - Training in the practical use of PMIS as a tool for gender-responsive personnel planning
  
- Strengthen the Gender Taskforce.
  - Review Terms of Reference of the Gender Taskforce and describe duties in detail
  - In cooperation with the Gender Taskforce, design a work plan with clear and feasible objectives and a timeframe
  - Describe the role and duties of Gender Focal Points
  - Hold regular meeting for the monitoring of progress
  
- Support CFAW
  - Assist CFAW in setting up a detailed program with clear objectives and terms of reference for its members
  
- Assist in setting up modularized training curricula for leaders, civil servants, CFAW members and mass organizations. Close cooperation with management schools and DOP
  
- Liaise with the upcoming ADB Project on gender training activities to avoid overlapping.

### **Objective 2. Output 2.4**

*The capacity of MARD Agriculture Management Schools is strengthened in critical administrative reform related and competence training*

- Assist in the design of training plans and documents for gender training for different focus groups of civil servants, pre-test and adjust them:
  - Leadership and management positions
  - Operational staff
- Train teachers in gender awareness and in participatory methodology for gender training
- Set up a pilot model to test the integration of gender concepts in the curricula, assess the results and get feed-back from the participants in order to improve content and methodology
- Together with DOP, discuss the possibility of the introduction of an official Certificate on Gender Training and draw the terms of reference

**Objective 3. Output 3.4.**

*The state administration management information communication with local level via intranet, internet and email is standardized.*

- Design a short, focused and appealing document on gender awareness and use the MARD intranet for large dissemination.
- Make the Gender Strategy and POA available on the MARD intranet.

**II. Recommendations for MARD**

- Evaluate the Gender Plan of Action and design a new POA from the Year 2005 in cooperation with the implementing departments in order to ensure its feasibility.
- Set up regulations to ensure the commitment and the support of leaders to gender equality and mainstreaming.
- Integrate gender equality/mainstreaming into objectives of offices and into job descriptions of key-positions
- Strengthen the position of (sub-) CFAW by integrating it into the organizational chart of MARD.
- Issue regulations and official TORs for (sub-) CFAW members (time to be worked, duties and responsibilities etc.).
- Set up a detailed budget plan for CFAW and allocate budget.
- Regular monitoring of the implementation process by (sub-) CFAW and reporting to high leaders. Enforce implementation through directives to departments.
- Carry out a survey on working conditions of women including a needs assessment for improved security at the working place and set up regulations to improve the situation (e.g. handling with harmful substances, control of restrooms/changing rooms especially in rural areas).
- Support the upgrading professional and management training of female servants in order to prepare them for (key)-leadership positions



- Make gender training compulsory for promotion

### **III. Other recommendations**

- Improve inter-ministerial co-operation on
  - Integration of gender issues into school and university curricula
  - Social benefits

## **Outlook**

The interviews with 202 civil servants in the MARD system have allowed collecting different opinions on gender equality and gender mainstreaming.

However, this study does not include the ideas of civil servant in the agricultural and rural development sector at province and district level who face a different situation from the central level.

The results of this study should be used for further assessments and surveys which will be necessary to collect additional information on the needs of both male and female civil servants at central and local level.

# Annexes

## Annex 1: Guidelines for Semi-Structured Interviews

### Before the interview ask or check:

- Since when does the interviewee work in this office?
- Position incl. tasks and responsibilities, since when?
- Age
- Education level

### Introductory questions:

- Which kind of problems do you encounter within your work?
- How many staff members work in your section/office? How many women and men? How important is the ratio of men and women? What is the impact on the office work?

*☞ Direct the answers into gender related issues like access to promotion, training, retirement, social benefits, working conditions etc*

### FAMILY DUTIES AND WORK

- Do you have children? How old are they?
  - *If children in school age or below: Do you have any problems between the child care duties and your work? ☞ Take children to kinder garden, school etc.*
  - *If yes: why? How can this situation be improved? ☞ flexible working hours, kinder garden at MARD...*
  - What happens if your child is sick? Can you/ your colleagues take leave for caring about a sick child? What do you think about it?
  - Do you have any other problems between family duties and work? How do you manage them? ☞ Do not go too deep in this issue as it is not the objective of this study

### Additional questions to leaders:

- What are the problems of your staff to combine children and family duties with their work?
  - What is the impact on their work performance?
  - What can be done to tackle this issue?
  - What kind of support from your office/higher level/regulations is needed to tackle it?

## WORKING ENVIRONMENT

What are your problems in your work with other women/men (colleagues, direct superiors)? ☞ *Discrimination, unsuitable working environment, restrooms, harassment ...*

- How are they caused?
- What could be the solutions?
- What about the sharing of work/information/experience between male and female colleagues in your office?
- What kind of help would you need from your office/your superiors/regulations to overcome these problems?

## RECRUITMENT PROCESS

- What is your opinion about the existing recruitment process in your office?
  - Did you/do women or men face any obstacles to get recruited? Why?
  - Are there any specific recruitment requirements for men and women?
  - Are there any specific positions requiring only men or women? Why?
  - How can the recruitment be improved?

For young staff:

- What is the waiting time you had/have to wait until having an official position in your office? Why?
  - How can this situation be improved?

For DOP:

- Can you tell me about the recruitment process of new staff?
  - Is the current recruitment process satisfying? Why?
  - What are the procedures for recruitment and what are the problems that you face?
  - How is the recruitment panel set up? Why?
  - What do you do when your office needs to recruit new staff but there is no recruitment scheduled by the higher level?
    - ☞ *short-term contracts*
  - How do you select between male and female candidates? Why?
  - How can job descriptions be written in a way to encourage both men and female applicants to apply?
  - How can the recruitment process be improved in order to take ensure the into equality of both male and female candidates?

## TRAINING

### Do you have access to training?

*☞ upgrading professional training, management training, leadership training, postgraduate studies, training/study abroad*

- Do you have open access to information about training opportunities? If not, why?
- How is the selection process for training opportunities carried out? What are the criteria for selection?  
*☞ Men/women, age, position, relationship, seniority, professional need etc.*  
What do you think about it?
- Are there any problems for you to participate in a training course? Why?  
*☞ Selection process, family duties, age, not interested, etc*
- What is needed to improve this situation?
- *If the interviewee has not had upgrading training:* How can you upgrade your knowledge?

### For leaders

### What do you think about the quality of the staff members of your unit? Are there differences in the quality between men and women?

- What are the causes for the difference?
- What to do to improve the situation?

### How about training opportunities for staff?

- How can staff have access to information about training opportunities?
- Are training opportunities publicly announced? *If yes:* Have there be more men or women applying for?
- How do you select staff for training? Which staff for which training?
- What problem do you face with women or men for certain training positions?  
*☞ Study tours, leadership training, management training, training abroad*  
Why?
- How about your own training opportunities? What do you think about it?

## CAREER AND PROMOTION

### What are your aspirations/intentions for your career?

*If he/she wants to make career:*

- Why?
- How about the promotion process?
- Are there any constraints? *☞ Age, sex, education level....*  
Why?
- What could be the solutions to these constraints?

*If he/she does not want to make career:*

- Why?
- Are there any constraints? Why? ☞ *age, family constraints, lack of confidence, lack of motivation etc*
- What could be the solutions to these constraints?

For leaders

Is there any career planning?

*If yes: Who is designing the plans and which planning concepts do you have?*

*☞ are men and women equally considered ?*

How is the promotion of staff handled?

- Is there a promotion panel? If yes, how is it set up?
- What are the criteria for promotion in your office?
- What are the opportunities and obstacles for women or men to be promoted?  
*☞ Age, education, sex, relationship, seniority, performance etc*  
Why?
- Have there been any changes in the promotion process in the last years and if yes, why?
- What do you think about the suitability and efficacy of the current promotion process? How can it be improved?
- Who has access to management/leadership training? Why?
- How many female leaders do you have in your section? Why? What kind of leaders are they? (heads, deputy...). What about the power of these women?
- What is according to you the reason that only few women get into leadership positions? How could the ministry support the female leaders in their work?
- What can you yourself do to improve the situation?
- What are the obstacles for improvements?
- What kind of assistance do you need to improve this situation?

## **RETIREMENT AND SOCIAL BENEFITS**

What do you think about the social benefits?

*☞ mother leave, abortion leave...*

- Does the Women's Trade Committee/Trade Union organize retreat leave for civil servants? Is there any difference made between men and women?
- Do civil servants have access to a regular health examination? Is there any priority for women? ☞ *e.g. gynecological check*

For interviewees above 40 and personnel department:

What do you think about the suitability of the present retirement policies? Why?

## GENDER

Have you ever participated in gender training?

*If yes:*

- What do you think about it?
- What do you think about the usefulness/applicability of the training content in your work?
- What do you expect from (further) gender training in order to improve the working conditions for you and your colleagues/superiors?

*If no:*

- Why not? What are your ideas about the usefulness of such training?
- Who should participate in gender training? Why?

What do you think about the role of the Women Trade Committee or WU activities in your department?

- What is the impact/benefit of these activities for your daily work?
- What do you expect from them for improving your working conditions?

Have you ever heard of CFAW in MARD or of sub-CFAW in your department?

*If yes:*

- Who is participating in this committee? What do you think about the participation of men in this committee?
- How do you feel about the role of sub-CFAW (*if existing?*).
- What is the benefit of the presence of sub-CFAW for your working conditions?
- How would you expect from sub-CFAW for improving your working conditions/environment?
- How can gender equality become a routine in your daily work and in your relationship /attitudes with your colleagues/superiors? What would be the constraints?
- What do you think is needed to support gender equality?

*☞ E.g. training, changes in society, commitment from leaders, commitment to the regulations from staff side..*

- What activities would you carry out if you were the chairman of the CFAW/sub-CFAW? What kind of support would you need from MARD/the PAR project?

*For leaders*

Have you participated in gender training?

*If yes:*

- What do you think about the applicability of skills that you have learnt? Why?
- What have you learnt from this training for your responsibilities in integrating gender concepts in your office?
- What are your suggestions for improvement?

What is your perception of CFAW/ gender related groups?

- What are their activities?

- Which impact do their activities have on your work or on your way to improve the working conditions?
- *If no impact:* What kind of measures could be taken not to marginalize these groups but to actively integrate them into the system?
- What kind of constraints could there be?

## **GENDER MAINSTREAMING**

*For leaders:*

- What do you understand under gender mainstreaming?

*Continue only to ask if the interviewee shows good understanding on gender mainstreaming. Otherwise go to another subject!*

- What are the main objectives for gender mainstreaming in MARD/your department?

- Which main obstacles you face with the implementation of regulations and gender concepts in your work? Why?

*☞ Legislation; organizational; social; attitudes; slowness of changes; lack of financial means; lack of concepts; lack of commitment; lack of human resources; lack of practice oriented concepts*

- What could be done to improve this situation?
- Are enough human and financial resources available for gender related activities and for integrating gender into the work? If not, how to make them available?
- What kind of assistance would you need for to improve the implementation of mainstreaming?
- What can you (*as leader*)/ PAR/MARD do to support your effort?

*For Planning department, DOP, Office of MARD, CFAW, Financial Department, Leadership in all departments and MARD schools*

- What do you know about the Gender Strategy and the Gender Action Plan for MARD? *☞ The Gender Strategy in Agriculture and Rural development to the Year 2010 and the Gender Action Plan to the Year 2005 have been approved in October 2003.*

- What kind of activities were you able/are you able to implement?
- Which activities have not yet been implemented? Why?
- Could you/can you meet the deadlines of the Plan? Why/Why not?
- What are the problems you meet?

*☞ isolation, lack of concepts, attitude of other staff, no commitment*

- How do you think can this be improved?
- Are enough human and financial resources available for gender related activities and for integrating gender into the work? If not, how to make them available?
- What can your superiors/PAR/MARD/ do to support your effort?

- Do you have any gender focal point in your office?

*If yes:*

- What are their activities? What do they intend to do?
- What do you think about their effectiveness?
- How to improve?

*If no gender focal point:*

- Why not? What do you think about the role and necessity of a gender focal point?
- How could they implement their tasks?

- What links, cooperation and co-ordination exist between gender related groups (CFAW/WTC/gender task force/gender focal points/WU)?
  - How to improve/establish links?

*For CFAW/sub-CFAW members:*

- What is your mandate? Your tasks?
- Do you have an own strategic plan for CFAW activities and for mainstreaming gender into MARD/your department?
  - What kind of activities can you implement?
  - What are the problems you meet?
- What kind of measures could be taken not to marginalize these groups but to actively integrate them into the system?

#### **ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS FOR SCHOOLS:**

- Have you participated in gender training?
  - Did other/all the staff members of the school participate? *If not: why not?*
  - What do you think about the importance and effectiveness of gender training for your work? ☞ *with regard both to the working environment and with regard to the participants*
  - What are your ideas on the importance and how to introduce gender issues in the teaching curricula?
  - What gender related subject could be taught that can be used in practice?  
☞ *Gender concepts, gender awareness, gender equality, how to integrate gender in daily work..*  
Which subjects for which target participants?
  - What could be the obstacles of the introduction of gender in the school system?  
☞ *lack of budget; lack of human resources, lack of knowledge, lack of concepts....*
  - What kind of support would be needed?



**ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS FOR IT SECTIONS:**

- How many male/female staff members work in your office?
  - How important is the ratio men: women? What do you think about the impact on the work in your office?
  - Is there any difference between men and women in accessing ICT?
  - How can women and men differently contribute to effectiveness of your work? What do you think about the contribution of women in the ICT field?

**ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS ON MASS ORGANIZATIONS IN MARD:**

- What do you think about the role of the Communist Party/Trade Union/Youth's Union in mainstreaming gender into MARD's activities/your unit?

## Annex 2: Locations and Profiles of Interviewees

Department	Position	Sex	Age	Education level
<b><u>HANOI</u></b>				
<b>Vu Departments</b>				
Department of Organisation and Personnel	Leadership	F	50	University
	Staff	M	47	Postgraduate
	Staff	M	54	University
	Staff	M	54	University
	Staff	F	42	University
	Staff	F	34	University
	Staff	M	48	University
Planning & Projections Department	Leadership	M	51	Postgraduate
	Leadership	F	51	University
	Support staff	F	30	Middle school
	Staff	F	53	University
	Staff	M	35	Studying postgraduate
	Staff	M	48	Postgraduate
Legal Department	Head	M	39	Postgraduate
	Staff	M	55	Postgraduate
	Staff	F	39	Postgraduate
	Staff	F	32	University
	Staff	M	27	University
Finance Department	Staff	F	47	University
	Staff	M	44	Postgraduate
Dep. for International Cooperation	Leadership	F	48	University
	Staff	F	54	University
	Staff	M	43	Postgraduate
Science and Technology Department	Leadership	M	53	Postgraduate
	Staff	M	45	Postgraduate
	Staff	F	38	University

### Cuc Departments and other departments

Dep. of Agriculture	Leadership	M	51	Postgraduate
	Head	M	46	Postgraduate
	Head	F	50	Postgraduate
	Head	M	43	University
	Head	M	43	Postgraduate
	Staff	F	32	University
Dep. of Forestry	Leadership	M	55	Postgraduate
	Leadership	M	49	University
	Staff	M	55	University
	Staff	F	46	University
Dep. of Animal Health	Leadership	M	52	University
	Staff	F	31	Postgraduate
	Head	F	48	Postgraduate
	Staff	M	28	University
Dep. of Irrigation and Water Management	Leadership	M	58	Postgraduate
	Head	M	54	Engineer
	Head	M	55	University
	Head	M	>40	University
	Staff	F	50	Postgraduate
Dep. of Plant Protection	Head	M	40	University
	Head	M	35	Postgraduate
	Staff	F	50	Postgraduate
	Leadership	F	52	University
Cooperatives & Rural Development Department	Head	F	46	University
	Head	M	49	University
	Staff	F	55	University
Dep. of Forestry Protection	Head	M	46	University
	Staff	F	36	University
Dep. of Agroforestry Products Processing and Salt	Leadership	M	58	University
	Staff	F	32	University
	Staff	M	27	University
Dep. of Public Works Management	Leadership	M	55	University
	Head	M	48	University
	Staff	F	48	University

Dep. of Dike Management and Flood Prevention	Leadership	M	49	Postgraduate
	Staff	F	51	University
	Head	M	43	University
Inspectorate of the Ministry	Leadership	M	50	University
	Staff	F	33	University
National Center for Agricultural Extension	Leadership	F	50	University
	Head	F	48	Postgraduate
	Head	F	39	University
	Head	M	52	Postgraduate
	Staff	M	36	University
Information Center	Leadership	M	51	University
	Head	F	45	Postgraduate
	Head	F	45	Postgraduate
<b>OMARD, Mass organizations in MARD</b>				
Secretariat General of MARD (OMARD)	Leadership	M	50	University
	Head	F	51	University
	Staff	M	25	University
	Staff	F	45	University
	Head	M	55	University
	Head	M	45	University
MTrade Union of the Ministry	Leadership	M	59	University
	Leadership	F	54	University
	Staff	M	30	University
Trade Union of Agricultural & Rural Development Sector	Leadership	M	49	University
	Staff	F	38	University
	Staff	M	58	University
Communist Party	Head	M	>45	University
CFAW	Leadership	M	59	University
Ministerial Youth Union	Secretary	F	32	University
Forestry Sector Development Program	Leadership	F	50	University

**Institutes**

Nat. Veterinary Research Institute	Leadership	F	50	Postgraduate
	Head	F	33	Postgraduate
	Researcher	M	27	University
	Technical staff	F	48	Technical school
Nat. Institute for Animal Husbandry	Leadership	M	54	Postgraduate
	Researcher	M	34	University
	Technical staff	M	32	University
	Staff	F	47	Postgraduate
Institute for Irrigation Science	Leadership	F	52	Postgraduate
	Staff	F	53	University
	Head	F	48	University
Institute for Irrigation Programming	Leadership	M	54	Postgraduate
	Head	M	57	University
	Staff	M	44	Postgraduate
Institute for Forestry Inspection and Planning	Leadership	M	52	Postgraduate
	Staff	F	51	University
	Head	F	44	Postgraduate
Institute for Rural Electricity and Post Harvest Technology	Leadership	M	52	Postgraduate
	Head	F	53	Postgraduate
	Researcher	F	27	University
	Staff	M	53	University
Institute for Agricultural Planning and Designing	Leadership	M	50	Postgraduate
	Researcher	F	37	Postgraduate
	Staff	M	53	University

**Companies**

Vietnam National Livestock Corporation	Leadership	M	54	Postgraduate
	Head	M	44	University
	Staff	F	48	University
Vietnam National Coffee Corporation	Leadership	F	54	University
	Leadership	M	50	University
	Head	F	38	University
	Staff	M	34	University
National Joint Stock Company for Seeds	Head	M	43	University
	Head	M	37	University
	Staff	F	48	University

Agricultural Input Corporation	Leadership	M	52	University
	Head	M	51	University
	Staff	F	43	Technical school
Fruit, Vegetable and Agricultural Products Corporation	Leadership	F	52	University
	Head	F	38	University
	Head	F	53	University
	Support staff	M	57	Technical training
Vietnam Forestry Corporation	Head	M	42	University
	Head	F	45	University
	Head	F	45	University
	Head	F	39	University
Irrigation Works Company no. 1	Head	F	48	University
	Leadership	M	59	University
	Staff	M	39	University
Company for Exploitation of Water Resources	Head	F	48	Technical school
	Head	M	55	University
	Staff	M	31	University
National Forestry Seedling Company	Head	F	32	University
	Head	F	40	University
<b>Schools</b>				
Agricultural and Rural Dev. Management School I	Leadership	M	50	University
	Leadership	M	53	Postgraduate
	Teacher	M	42	Postgraduate
	Teacher	F	33	Postgraduate
	Teacher	F	47	Postgraduate
University of Irrigation	Leadership	M	51	Postgraduate
	Head	F	32	Postgraduate
	Teacher	F	35	Postgraduate
University of Forestry	Head	M	40	Postgraduate
	Leadership	M	53	Postgraduate
	Lecturer/Head	F	52	Postgraduate
	Lecturer	M	34	Postgraduate
Secondary and Vocational School for Agriculture & Rural Dev. I	Head	M	47	Postgraduate
	Leadership	M	49	Postgraduate
	Head	F	47	Postgraduate
	Teacher	F	29	Postgraduate

Vocational School for Electricity in Agriculture and Rural Development	Farm worker	M	32	Vocational school
	Head	M	47	University
	Teacher	F	26	University
	Staff	F	36	Technical school

## **HO CHI MINH CITY**

### **Cuc Departments**

Forestry Department	Leader	M	53	Postgraduate
	Staff	M	44	University
Agricultural Department	Head	M	35	University
	Staff	F	45	Postgraduate
	Staff	F	34	University
Dep.for Water Management and Irrigation	Leader	M	43	University
	Staff	M	50	University
	Staff	M	58	University

### **Mass organizations**

Southern Trade Union for Local Level	Leadership	F	52	University
	Leadership	F	44	University

### **Institutes**

Southern Institute for Agricultural Science and Technology	Leadership	F	54	University
	Head	F	48	University
	Head	M	39	Postgraduate
	Head	M	50	Postgraduate

### **Companies**

Rubber Corporation	Leader	M	52	University
	Staff	M	47	University
	Head	F	50	Postgraduate
Company for Material Supply for Plant Protection no.2	Leadership	M	42	Postgraduate
	Head	F	34	University
	Head	F	52	University
Sugarcane corporation no.2	Leadership	M	>40	University

	Head	F	45	University
	Head	F	34	University
Vietnam Company for Disinfestations	Leader	M	45	University
	Head	F	42	Postgraduate
	Head	M	44	University
National Company for Veterinary Products II (NAVETCO)	Leadership	M	56	University
	Head	F	51	University
	Staff	M	33	University
Company for Irrigation Machines - Investment and Construction	Staff	F	54	University
	Staff	M	26	Technical school
	Head	M	50	University
<b>Schools</b>				
Agricultural and Rural Development Management School II	Head	M	53	University
	Teacher	F	37	Postgraduate
	Teacher	M	29	University
	Teacher	F	27	University
	Leader	F	49	University
	Head	M	56	University
Secondary School for Food and Food Stuff	Leader	M	45	University
	Teacher	M	36	University
	Teacher	F	40	University
	Teacher	F	27	University



### Annex 3: Group discussions (Participating units)

<b>Group discussions leaders</b>		<b>No. of participants</b>
1.	Legal Department	1
2.	Department of Finance	1
3.	Department of Agriculture	1
4.	Department of Forestry	1
5.	National Agriculture Extension Center	1
6.	Trade Union of the Ministry	1
7.	Office of MARD	1
8.	Agricultural and Rural Development. Management School I	1
		<b>8</b>
<b>Group discussions staff</b>		
1.	Representative of Office of MARD in HCMC	3
2.	Department of Planning	1
3.	Department of Agro-Forestry Product Processing and Salt	1
4.	Department of Cooperatives and Rural Development	1
5.	Trade Union Branch of the South	1
6.	Information Center	1
7.	Institute for Agricultural Science and Technology	1
8.	Research Institute for Vegetables and Fruits	1
9.	Southern Institute for Water Management Science	1
10.	Sub-institute for Agricultural Planning and Design	3
11.	Agricultural and Rural Development. Management School I	2
12.	Agricultural and Rural Development Management School II	1
13.	High School for Food and Food Stuff	3
14.	Corporation for Construction no. 4	1
15.	Company for Import & Export of Cereals	1
16.	Southern Joint Stock Company for Seeds	1
		<b>23</b>

## Annex 4: Persons involved in the Study

Supervision of the organization of the study	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Mr La Van Ly, National Project Director</li><li>• Ms Nguyen Thi Thanh, Acting National Project Manager</li></ul>
Consultants in charge of the qualitative study	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Dr Astrid Tripodi, International Consultant</li><li>• Dr Ta Ngoc Sinh, National Consultant</li></ul>
Interviewers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Ms Tran Thi Tram Anh</li><li>• Ms Doan Thi Mai</li><li>• Ms Luu Vu Mai</li><li>• Mr Tran Thanh Van</li></ul>
Logistics	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Ms Tran Thi Chin</li><li>• Ms Doan Thi Thu Hien</li><li>• Ms Tran Kim Oanh</li></ul>